

Methodology for cost-benefit analysis for the use of BIM in public tenders

Calculating Costs and Benefits for the use of Building Information Modelling in Public tenders

CBA Tool Training Session





CBA TOOL

"Cost-benefit analysis model for the use of BIM in public tenders"

Training Session



Presentation of the Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) tool through:

• Guidelines and insights to use the tool and simulate a cost-benefit analysis



• Video tutorial sections with a practical example

1.2 In how many projects is BIM adopted, every year, on average?	
1.3 In New many purplets per year, on zverage, might BMI he adapted (in the case where your organization does not have previous experience with BMI)? 15	
Please select whether the project under analysis refers to a new asset construction or to work on an asisting Judding/Infrastructure (renovation, refurbalment, etc.).	
New Asset construction	
2.2 In the case where the project refers : work on a waiting building, is there a IIM model a sky available?	
Please indicate below the actual or a material as mover/ment. mover/ment.	
12 Cost of planoing (including: ign) 12 Cost of construction 1	
Please select the planned number of the set of the planned of the project, from the group down manue. In the case 4.1 where the action plana period referer fractions of planna adout the number of years tart is the depart to the set is the depart to the set.	
Please select the number of years beam from the start of the project planning activities to the completion of the design activities 42 and the subsequence text of the construction plane, from the design activities the activity plane previous relativities to find the subsequence text of the construction plane, from the design activities activities activities the find the subsequence of the subsequence of the subsequence of the start of plane.	



The CBA Tool





WHAT?

Excel tool to evaluate whether the use of BIM in public works is expected to be advantageous and sustainable (small/medium projects: <50 M€)

WHO?

European public entities at various administrative levels with varying degrees of knowledge and experience of BIM

HOW?

Considering both financial and economic analyses and providing qualitative and quantitative information starting from basic and limited inputs



The CBA Tool



WHEN?

When a public entity needs to evaluate if it is feasible to use BIM for construction, renovation, operation and facility management in a single specific project

WHERE?

It can be applied in every European country with various contexts and diverse starting conditions

Downloadable at http://www.eubim.eu/



The Input sheet





The Input sheet: General Rules Close-ended The information must be entered in the white questions Yes **Open questions** 200000 All the white spaces must be completed unless

In how many projects is BIM adopted, every year, on average?

In how many projects per year, on average, might BIM be adopted (in the case

Please indicate the information required below describing your organisation experience with BIM

where your organisation does not have previous experience with BIM)?

- otherwise indicated Please indicate the information required below describing your organisation experience with BIM. Does your organisation have previous experience with BIM (has it started any pilot Some cells alternatively become greys based on 1.1 project or completed one adopting BIM)?
- Do not complete the grey cells
- The inflation rate is the only value already in

cluded (2%), but it can be modified	1.1 Does your organisation have previous experience with BIM (has it started any pilot project or completed one adopting BIM)?	
Please indicate the inflation rate for the project period (%).	1.2 In how many projects is BIM adopted, every year, on average?	
2%	1.3 In how many projects per year, on average, might BIM be adopted (in the case where your organisation does not have previous experience with BIM)?	

12

1.3



11

spaces

your choice

٠



Preliminary General Information

Information Required

- the organisation's experience with BIM
- the number of tenders in which BIM is or is expected to be used every year
- Internal employees (e.g. average annual salary and BIM experience)
- Type of project (construction/renovation)
- Project costs and timing
- Specific data for defining the main features of the project







Preliminary General Information: Insights

• 2.1 and 2.2. → Type of project: New asset construction or Work on an existing asset



- 4.1 → For the duration of the construction phase 1 to 10 years can be chosen
- 4.2 → For the duration of the planning and design phase 1 to 5 years can be chosen
- 6 → The Gross Floor Area should not be completed for the infrastructural assets that don't include buildings





Please indicate the Gross Floor Area of the project asset (in m^2) in the case where the project refers to a building or to an infrastructural asset that includes buildings in its perimeters, otherwise, please leave the space blank. The Gross Floor Area (GFA) is the sum of the floor areas of all the spaces within the building, with no exclusions; it essentially corresponds to the total area within the perimeter of the outside walls.

1800







Information Required

Level of Detail/Development (LOD)
 required in the tender

Category of asset

The national hourly cost for a BIM specialist







12 \rightarrow Level of Detail/Development (LOD) required in the tender

Basic Design LOD 200

Detailed Design LOD 350

Digital Twin LOD 450/500







14→ The hourly cost of a BIM specialist for a public client:

If you don't know this cost

Example

The average hourly gross wage of a "BIM Specialist" working in your country + 50% ↓ assumed company mark-up for the hourly rate charged to the public client



Architecture and Structure/MEP Design/Infrastructure Structure and Systems









3 Architecture and Structure

Information Required

- Size of the building's areas: "area surface category"
 - Rooms
 - Façades
 - Roof
- Average level of complexity of each area category
- Number of areas belonging to each area category
- Average level of standardisation of the building's areas

15	Please, select Yes/No to indica complexity for each category.	te the presence of ar (1)	eas of the proposed surfaces and indicate the average of the proposed surfaces and indicate the average of the second s	ge degree of
	Area surface category	Choose: Yes / No	Indicate the level of complexity for each existing area category	
	Surface < 25 m^2	Ye:		
	150 m^2 < Surface < 150 m^2	Ye		
	Surface > 300 m^2	Ye		
16	Please, indicate the number of	f areas of each sur	-gory.	
		Number of		
		are		
	Surface < 25 m^2	125		
	25 m²2 < Surface < 150 m²2 150 m²2 < Surface < 300 m²2	5		
	Surface > 300 m^2	1		
	,			
17	Please, indicate the average le	vel of standardization	(1,2,3) of areas of the asset, based on the scale tha	t can be visualize





15 → Area surface category



Low = 1

Level of Complexity



High = 3



• 17 → Level of Standardisation









^{\here} MEP DESIGN ('Building' and 'Mixed' assets)

Information Required

 Indication of the presence of the system, e.g. mechanical, piping, etc.

18	Mechanical system
	Yes
19	Piping system
	Yes
20	Electrical and Lighting system
	Yes
21	Special systems (Firefighting and Safety systems, Medical Gas system, etc.)
	Yes

- Level of complexity of the system
- Area served by the system

	Please indicate, in the section below, referring to the project asset, the presence of the proposed systems (by selecting Yes /No) and the level of complexity of each system based on the scale provided by clicking on the "i" button.
	In addition, please select the extension of the area served by each existing system, from the surface categories proposed (Please fill in only white cells).
18	Mechanical system Yes
	Please indicate the level of complexity of a system. (I)
	1 Please indicate the size of the area of
	1 - Surface < 400 m ² 2 - 400 m ² < Surface < 1500 m ² 3 - 1500 m ² < Surface < 3000 m ²
	4 - 3000 m²2 < Surface < 5000 m²2 5 - Surface > 5000 m²2
	2
19	Piping system Yes



3







Infrastructure Surface and Systems

Category of asset: Infrastructure or Mixed

	22	Please indicate, in this section, dedicated solely to assets that have been indicated as "INFRASTRUCTURE" or as "MIXED", the required information. Please, remember to avoid entering any number/information in grey cells.
		Please, indicate the infrastructure total surface (m^2).
		m^2
		Please, select the level of complexity of the infrastructural asset based on the scale available by clicking on the "i" button. $(\frac{1}{2})$
		Please, select Yes/No to indicate the presence of the following systems, their level of complexity, based on the scale that is displayed by clicking on the "i" button, and the area of the infrastructure served by each system (please, remember to not fill out grey cells).
	23	Mechanical system
		Please select the level of complexity of the mechanical system. $(\underline{1})$
۶		
YSTE		Please indicate the size of the surface served by the mechanical system (m^2).
ANDS		m^2
ACE	24	Piping system
SUR		
CTURE		Please select the level of complexity of the piping system. $(\hat{\mathbf{j}})$
TRUC		
FRAS		Please indicate the size of the surface served by the piping system (m^2).
Z		m^2
	25	Electrical and Lighting system



¹ Infrastructure Surface and Systems: Insights

 The size of the surface served by MEP systems



Calculate the area served by MEP systems as a geometric projection (only for the specific zones where there are systems) and repeat it for all the systems present

Electrical and Lighting System





3

Electrical and Lighting System

Examples

The Results sheet - Introduction



- The Results sheet summarizes the main outputs of the CBA automatically performed by the tool.
- The page has a simple structure allowing to be easily consulted by the user.
- It contains only one cell whose content can be modified by the user.





The Results sheet - Main indicators



• Two essential indicators represent the CBA Tool key outputs:

1. Benefit-Cost Ratio / Economic Benefit-Cost Ratio

It describes the relationship between the benefits and the costs associated to the adoption of BIM in the project.

Benefit-Cost Ratio = 1 → Value of benefits brought by BIM are equal to the associated costs. Benefit-Cost Ratio < 1 → Costs connected to BIM adoption outweigh the related benefits. Benefit-Cost Ratio > 1 → Benefits arising from BIM adoption exceed the required costs.

2. Net Present Value / Economic Net Present Value

It evaluates the profitability of an investment over a period. In the case of BIM, the profitability is expressed as achievable savings.

Net Present Value = 0 → Adopting BIM does not provide any relevant gain (or loss).
 Net Present Value < 0 → Savings generated by BIM adoption do not justify the investment.
 Net Present Value > 0 → The adoption of BIM is expected to be advantageous and sustainable.





The Results sheet - BIM direct expenses

BIM direct expenses at BIM maturity level 1 (level 2 does not foresee a "BIM model cost" item)



* Expenses tend to be low in this case as the building is characterized by low complexity levels of areas and an overall high level of standardization





The Results sheet - Phase focus

BIM maturity level 1



BIM maturity level 2



The ENPV of the Planning & Design phase is still negative but the one from the Operation and Maintenance phase becomes positive.





The Results sheet – Estimate scenarios

• CBA Tool incorporates the option to select three different scenarios that provide different estimate values.

Select the scenario to be considered in the analysis (Baseline Estimate, Optimistic Estimate, Pessimistic Estimate)



The different estimate scenarios are provided changing the value of key variables included in the computation of a set of benefits and costs.

Variables affecting benefits

investment reduction (%) associated with enhanced accuracy of BIM-based quantity take-off

investment reduction (%) associated with early clashes and error detection

investment reduction (%) associated with time savings during the design and construction phases of a project

Annual expenses reduction (%) associated with the operations phase related to enhanced efficiency in asset maintenance activities

Variables affecting costs

Value of the public organisation procurement process cost

Value of the annual BIM-related software investment allocated to the project

Value of the BIM-related investment in training allocated to the project

BIM modelling and coordination costs (the modelling activity cost refers solely to BIM maturity level 1)





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets - Introduction

- CBA Tool includes two pages entirely devoted to show the Cost and Benefit analysis and the annual values of the benefit and cost indicators considered.
- The user can interact with a set of cells selecting different options and subsequently consulting how changes affected results.
- This page (both in case of BIM maturity level 1 and 2) is made up of three main sections.





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets - Features



Automatic allocation of costs and benefits values

Maturity level 1						
Benefits	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 1
Cost reduction due to early clashes and error detection and subsequent reduction of changes necessary in construction phase						6,235
Cost reduction associated with more precise quantity take-offs						82,903
Cost reduction related to lower costs for claims/litigations	2,181	2,224	2,269	2,314		2,360
Time savings in design and construction phases and associated project duration reduction	4,438	4,527	4,617	4,710		4,804
Public entity personnel labour cost reduction due to faster document analysis for facility management and maintenance						
Cost reduction associated to more efficient annual maintenance						
Cost reduction attributable to the government/society due to better Health & Safety						14,560
CO2 emission reduction due to reduced material wasted						133
fot. benefits	6,619	6,751	6,886	7,024	0	110,996

Example 1

Example 2

•

•

Example 2

Year 1	Year 1 Year 2 Year 3 Year 4 Year 5								
					10				
					79				
4,050	4,131				4				
8,242	8,407				8				
					23				
12,292	12,538	0	0	0	128				

Planning & Design period: 2 years

Construction period: 5 years

Example 1

- Planning & Design period: 4 years
- Construction period: 9 years





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets – Phase focus

- The page interface is divided into three project phases, all visible by selecting the option "All phases" at the top-left of the page.
 - 1. Planning and Design
 - 2. Construction
 - 3. Operation and Maintenance

Plan	ining and Desi	gn					
Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 1	Year 2	Year 4	
2,410	2,458	2,507					
4,904	5,002	5,102			Em	pty	



Planning and Design

Planning and Design				Construction													
Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Year 7	Year 8	Year 9	Year 10	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4
				5,261	5,366	5,474	5,583	5,635	5,803	5,925	6,043						
			_	82,903										l			
	— ———			2,557	2,608	2,660	2,714	2,768	2,823	2,880	2,937				Empty		
	Em	ptv		5,204	5,308	5,414	5,523	5,633	5,746	5,861	5,978						
		- 7														10.07	
				16,380	16,707	17,041	17,382	17,730	18,084	18,446	18,815						
				150	153	156	153	163	166	163	172						

Construction

Operation and Maintenance

											Оре	eration and M	laintenance
Year 8	Year 9	Year 10	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Year 7	Year 8	Year 9	Year 10	Year 11
	_												
F	-mnt	V 🛛											
		,	917	935	354	973	993	1,012	1,033	1,053	1,074	1,096	1,118
			2,493	2,542	2,593	2,645	2,698	2,752	2,807	2,863	2,920	2,979	3,038





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets – Features

• Each cost and benefit indicator follow different rules for its allocation along the project periods (either "one-shot" at the beginning or end of a phase or distributed over one or more phases).

On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during pre-tendering phase	1,095	1,117	1,139	1,162		
On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during tendering phase				3,593		
On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during post-award phase						435
On	Increased cost for consulting services to the public procurement process	199	203	207	212		216
On	BIM modelling activity cost (assumed to be outsourced)	1,971	2,010	2,050	2,091		
On	Public entity hardware upgrade investment (share allocated to the specific project)	4,842					
On	Public entity annual software license fee (share allocated to the specific project)	5,000	5,100	5,202	5,306		5,412
On	Personnel training costs (share allocated to the specific project)	15,744					
On	BIM Coordination Cost	556	567	578	590		
	Tot. costs	29,407	8,998	9,178	12,954	0	6,123

• Cost and benefit indicators can be switched on and off basing on the user's preference and needs.

On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during pre-tendering phase	1,035	1,117	1,139	1,162		
On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during tendering phase				3,593		
On	Public entity personnel labour cost increase during post-award phase						495
Off	Increased cost for consulting services to the public procurement process						
On	BIM modelling activity cost (assumed to be outsourced)	1,971	2,010	2,050	2,091		
Off	Public entity hardware upgrade investment (share allocated to the specific project)						
On	Public entity annual software license fee (share allocated to the specific project)	5,000	5,100	5,202	5,306		5,412
On	Personnel training costs (share allocated to the specific project)	15,744					
Off	BIM Coordination Cost						
	Tot. costs	23,810	8,227	8,392	12,153	0	5,907





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets – Features

• The key row to be consulted reporting the cashflow reflecting the adoption of BIM in the project:

sh Flow for ENPV	- 43,956	245,562 -	324 -	331 -	
Discount rate	47	· · · ·	👂 This discou	int rate ca	an k
Economic Net Present Value	1	71,958	changed by	/ the user	. it
Actualized Economic Benefits	2	68,177	set at 4% a	s default	val
Actualized Economic Costs (Actualized Costs)		96,219		o doladit	va
Economic B/C Ratio		2.79			
Yield		1.79			
Discount rate	72	<u> </u>			
Economic Net Present Value	16	7,207			
Actualized Economic Benefits	25	0,799			
Actualized Economic Costs (Actualized Costs)	8	3,593			
Economic B/C Ratio		3.00			
Yield		2.00			





The CBA - BIM level 1/2 sheets – Last sections

Section devoted to ENPV and Economic B/C Ratio computations per project phase

		Planning and Design					
Year of the phase	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 1	Year 2
Benefits accrued during the phase	7,170	7,314	7,460	7,609		112,456	20,143
Costs accrued during the phase	23,810	8,227	8,392	12,153		5,907	6,025
Net Income (phase related)	- 16,639	- 914	932	- 4,543	-	106,548	24,118
							~
Actualized benefit (phase related)	27,864					304,006	
Actualized costs (phase related)	50,283					44,197	
B/C Ratio (phase related)	0.55					6.88	
NPV (phase related)	- 22,418					259,809	

inancial benefits	Year	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
	Benefits (financial only)	7,170	7,314	7,460
	Benefits adjusted for cashflow (financial only)	7,170	7,314	7,460
	Benefits adjusted along years (financial only)	7,170	7,314	7,460
ш.—	Actualized benefit (financial only)	217,654		

a	Year	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
nanci costs	Costs (financial only)	23,810	8,227	8,392
	Costs adjusted along years (financial only)	23,810	8,227	8,392
iii —	Actualized cost (financial only)	127,832		

	Year	Year 1	Yea	r 2	Ye	ear 3
Financial NPV	Net Income	- 16,633		914	•	932
	Free cashflow	- 16,633		914		932
	Free cashflow adjusted over the years	- 16,633		9/4	-	932
	Net Present Value (financial only)	89,822				
	B/C Ratio	1.70				

Section devoted to NPV and B/C Ratio computations

(excluding social and environmental benefits from the computation)



Conclusions



- Fostering BIM adoption in the construction industry is a key issue to address, in order to pave the way toward digitalization
- This study showed that there is still a limited awareness about the benefits of using BIM and how these benefits could in part, or totally, compensate the costs of its adoption
- The developed methodology enables public procurers to estimate, ex-ante, the benefit-cost ratio of the adoption/decision for a specific foreseen investment
- Focus on measuring not only the financial benefits but also economic benefits more related to the socio-environmental field

